

# Concise Minutes – Public Accounts Committee

---

Meeting Venue:

**Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

Meeting date: Tuesday, 8 March 2016

Meeting time: 09.02 – 11.01

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/3383>

---

## Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Darren Millar AM (Chair) Mohammad Asghar (Oscar) AM Jocelyn Davies AM Mike Hedges AM Sandy Mewies AM Jenny Rathbone AM Aled Roberts AM David Rees AM (In place of Julie Morgan AM)
Witnesses:	Gareth Bullock, Finance Wales James Price, Welsh Government
Committee Staff:	Meriel Singleton (Clerk) Claire Griffiths (Deputy Clerk) Joanest Varney–Jackson (Legal Adviser) Huw Vaughan Thomas (Auditor General for Wales) Mark Jones (Wales Audit Office)



## Transcript

View the [meeting transcript](#) (PDF 311KB) [View as HTML](#) (351KB)

### **1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions**

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed the Members to the meeting.
- 1.2 Apologies were received from Julie Morgan. David Rees substituted.

### **2 Papers to note**

2.1 The paper was noted. Members agreed to include a recommendation in its Legacy Report, that the successor Committee considers undertaking an inquiry into this topic.

#### **2.1 Letter to the Chair from the Auditor General for Wales**

### **3 Welsh Government Investment in Next Generation Broadband Infrastructure: Consideration of response to the Committees Report**

3.1 Members noted the responses and agreed to include a recommendation in the Committee's Legacy Report that the successor Committee seeks a further update on progress made in autumn 2016.

3.2 The Chair agreed to write to the Welsh Government seeking further clarification on the complexity of installing Broadband (R1), an indication of the possible cost over and above the value of the vouchers on offer (R2), what 'dynamic' means with regards to the consumer (R8) and a description of how the website has been improved.

### **4 Wales Life Science Investment Fund**

4.1 The Committee scrutinised James Price, Deputy Permanent Secretary, Economy, Skills and Natural Resources Group at the Welsh Government and Gareth Bullock, Chair, Finance Wales plc on Wales Life Science Investment Fund.

4.2 James Price agreed to:

- Provide clarification of the selection panel's composition, when the advisory panel appointments were made and the number of members appointed from outside Wales;

- Raise within the Welsh Government, whether legal advice sought by the Welsh Government should be shared with arms-length bodies;
- Confirm the level of grant funding offered to ReNeuron;
- Clarify whether full minutes were taken at the WIDAB meetings of 18 June 2013 and 24 October 2013.

4.3 Gareth Bullock agreed to provide further information regarding arrangement fees payable to Fund Managers from Investor Companies.

## **5 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:**

5.1 The motion was agreed.

## **6 Wales Life Science Investment Fund: Consideration of evidence received**

6.1 Due to time constraints, Members agreed to consider the evidence received in the meeting scheduled for 15 March 2016.